I. Goals of Journal Club

- Develop abilities to critically analyze the literature
- Recognize and understand how data are assembled to make a paper
- Practice presentation of scientific information in seminar-like format
- Deepen understanding of a particular field through focus, discussion
- Broaden scientific background
- Enjoy and/or appreciate other people’s science

II. New format for journal club, 2010-2011

3 weekly, focused clubs, each with faculty co-chairs, provisionally called
- Development and signaling (Drs. Stanley, Sibinga)
- Cancer (Drs. Kenny, Di Cristofano)
- Cell biology (Drs. Kuliawat, Wilson)

Clubs will meet each week to discuss selected recent (< 2 years old) papers of interest

The day and time of meeting for the focused clubs will be up to co-chairs

1 occasional plenary club (replaces weekly clubs for that week); tentatively scheduled for Wednesday at 1 PM in Chanin 525

This club is linked to the DMB sponsored external speaker seminars: a paper published by the speaker will be chosen and discussed in a DMB ‘plenary journal club’, a few days ahead of the speaker. Approximately 6 of our outside speakers for this year will be selected for this kind of treatment; each focused club will choose 2 speakers for their area (preferably by students/postdocs voting in the first club meeting)

Journal club run should finish in June (like WIP schedule)

III. Paper selection and distribution

Selection

Papers should be selected by students/postdocs a week in advance and approved by the co-chairs

Distribution

Links to papers will be placed on the DMB webpage via Google calendar

IV. Student/postdoc participation

General

Expectations for attendance

Attendance rate of at least 75% is expected. People who will not be attending should write to a designated co-chair in advance and cc their own PI.
If 2 or more unexcused absences accrue, student/PD name will be forwarded to his/her PI and JC committee. Additional JC presentations may be required to make up for poor attendance.

Expectations for participation

Attendees are expected to read the paper in advance and bring a copy (electronic or paper) to the meeting. Additional participation guidelines as per each focused club

Cancellation policy

If a scheduled presenter needs to change his/her assigned date, it is the presenter’s responsibility to arrange a swap with another presenter and communicate that to the co-chair

Outline/expectations for presentation

Title slide listing paper title, authors, etc.

Should include a rationale for selection of this paper

Short summary slide of paper – what are the highlights? (~3–4 sentences)

Background slides

orient the audience to the topic or problem addressed by the paper

(i.e what was the question or gap in knowledge)

should go beyond simply recounting the background provided by the authors, which may be self-serving

(prior related papers and reviews, especially from other groups, will help)

Methods slides

Methods used in the paper should be clearly described

Novel or unusual methods require more detailed explanation

Results slides

Present the data from the paper, maintaining a critical viewpoint

(does it show what the authors claim?)

Be sure to explain the methods used for each figure

Discussion

What do the authors claim?

How well supported are these claims? \[ \geq 1 \text{ slide} \]

What are strengths of the paper?

What are weaknesses of the paper? \[ \geq 1 \text{ slide} \]

Big picture consideration: what is the significance of this paper? How does it ‘move the field forward’? \[ \geq 1 \text{ slide} \]
Format of focused clubs (as per co-chairs; eventually want to compare different formats)

Development and signaling group approach (to promote discussion):

1. One student will present the paper, as above
2. At the beginning of each journal club, 2 students and 2 postdocs from the audience will be chosen to participate, and randomly assigned to act as the paper’s **advocate**; the other will act as the paper’s **antagonist**
3. Other audience members are expected to support their colleagues in the discussion

V. Student/postdoc selection of club

- Students/PDs should be free to choose 1 of the 3 journal clubs, but must declare a club by informing co-chairs of selected club, and their PI.
- Names will be allocated to lists for each club, and attendance will be recorded via a sign-in sheet maintained by co-chairs.

What do I do now?

- Within the next week, e-mail one of the co-chairs for the focus club you think you will want to attend
- We will assemble rosters for the 3 clubs as they form
- Undeclared individuals may be assigned to a club
- If you want to change later, check with the co-chairs involved
- You are free to attend other clubs, but your attendance will be recorded through ‘home club’